

**Minutes of the
CAREC Workshop on Training Needs Assessment
20-21 February 2009, Guangzhou, PRC**

Introduction

1. The 7th Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation (CAREC) Customs Cooperation Committee (CCC) meeting in September 2008 requested ADB for assistance in starting the process of addressing the perceived need for improved capacities in the areas of customs administration and trade facilitation in the region. More specifically, the CCC requested for assistance in conducting a study to, among other purposes, determine the training needs of relevant CAREC stakeholders in such areas.
2. From December 2008 to mid-February 2009, ADB consultants visited most of the CAREC countries and consulted with both public and private sector stakeholders to ascertain the state of knowledge and skills capabilities available in the region and identify gaps that need to be bridged.
3. The data and information that have been gathered were consolidated and a preliminary analysis has been made. A set of recommendations and initiatives have been drafted aimed at addressing the problems that have been identified.
4. At the Opening Remarks, **Mr. Ying Qian**, provided the rationale for the TNA exercise. He explained that the workshop aimed (i) discuss the results of the training needs survey; (ii) discuss and verify the common areas of concern and the specialized/customized training needed for particular countries/institutions; and (iii) present a draft capacity-building framework for trade facilitation.

Presentations

5. **Mr. Juan Robertino Macalde, CAREC Institute consultant**, recalled the events that led to the development of the proposed capacity building framework for the trade facilitation stakeholders. The exercise involved assessing training needs for customs and other stakeholders; identifying available institutional, financial and human resources at national and regional levels; designing standard curricula and tailor-made programs; recommending a capacity building framework and drafting recommendations to establish a common information space.
6. **Mr. Jeremy Wellens, consultant**, presented the 3-step approach to training development that involve (i) understanding the changes; (ii) identifying current capacity; and (iii) planning to develop for the future. He emphasized that training activities need to address knowledge, skills, and attitude equally well. He elaborated on what may be expected from a training and development program and the various training methodologies that may be employed and the general principles in the design of training programs. Based on the SWOT analysis, he emphasized that the following general principles should always be considered for training program design: identifying and evidencing the need; identifying the appropriate target level; making clear aims and objectives; identifying specific course content, adopting appropriate method, and evaluating outcomes.

7. Later, Mr. Wellens discussed in detail the training needs and the supply offered by each CAREC member country first for customs administration, then for integrated trade facilitation, and later the cross-cutting issues. He summarized the needs per sub-sector and noted the common training needs among the CAREC countries.

Deliberation and Conclusion

8. Despite the uneven stage of development of the member countries, there is a high degree of common need both for customs and the other areas of trade facilitation which can be met by a regional supply of training activities. Some countries need to further develop existing skills/knowledge, and it may be possible to meet some of the needs using internal resources/expertise – including from the private sector. Appendix 1 summarizes these training needs and proposed ways to meet these demands.

9. Discussions after the presentations focused on the following areas:

- **Training approaches need to adopt for CAREC region's needs and be consistent with the overall CAREC objectives for trade facilitation.** Participants repeatedly expressed the need to adapt training methodologies/content to the region's needs/situation and to fit into the CAREC overall program but also acknowledged the need to consider best practices not only from developed countries but especially from neighbouring countries in Asia. Local conditions must be considered and models from other countries/institutions must not be blindly adopted but carefully assessed whether they are applicable or must be re-designed to suit the requirements of CAREC countries. The need to consider the target audience was also pointed out to determine level of training needed e.g., policy analysis for policy makers and technical training for specialists.
- **Focus should be on enhancing available capabilities and facilities in the region.** A number of the CAREC countries pointed out that they have existing training facilities and capabilities that cater to customs administration and trade facilitation training requirements. Focus of assistance should be on further developing and strengthening these capabilities, in developing curricula that are more responsive to the current needs to be internationally competitive, upgrading the skills of faculties to international standards and ensuring that these capacities can be sustained.
- **Balance between focusing on common needs (regional) and specific training needs (national).** Participants agreed that addressing common needs such as policy formulation and skills training in adopting single window scheme, will not be a problem but providing training for more specific needs for each country will be more challenging. It would be ideal to address all training needs of CAREC member countries however resources are not limitless and it will be helpful if countries will do more detailed strengths weaknesses opportunities and threats (SWOT) analysis to refine priorities.
- **Involvement of other agencies, private sector/non-government organizations.** It was agreed that the other government agencies involved in border control and the private sector will have to be involved in the capacity building exercise including in the areas of coordination and cross-agency collaboration. Their participation in the

early stages of identifying needs and planning capacity building strategies will be crucial to ensuring the relevance of the training programs.

10. Based on identified needs and gaps, Mr. Wellens recommended the following:
 - establishment of regional and national level training and development committees;
 - creation of a simple Regional Training Database accessible to all CAREC member countries;
 - creation of a simple training development structure; and
 - delivery of a trade facilitation core curriculum.

11. Responses to the recommendations included the following:
 - ADB is currently promoting the creation of National Joint Transport and Trade Facilitation Coordinating Committee (NJC) in each CAREC country and a Regional Joint Transport and Trade Facilitation Coordinating Committee (RJC) to improve interagency collaboration and enhance partnerships between the public and private sectors. These NJCs are expected to serve as catalysts for change and capacity building for all stakeholders involved in trade facilitation will be a major task for the NJCs and the RJC. The terms of reference for the proposed national land regional training and development committees may be subsumed in the NJC/RJC terms of reference.
 - The proposal to create of a simple regional training database was well-accepted and deeper collaboration with other international organizations offering specialized training for customs administration and trade facilitation such as the World Customs Organization (WCO) will be pursued.

12. The participants agreed that the workshop provided them with an excellent opportunity to verify the findings of the training needs assessment exercise provide more focus on the assessment made and offer helpful suggestions to improve the report.

13. Additional information, clarifications and elaborations offered by the participants such as putting emphasis on providing member countries with good skills development (e.g. training of trainers, updated training methodologies and establishing linkages with international organizations) and including in the core curriculum courses on non-traditional customs tasks (anti-terrorism, anti-money laundering, drugs smuggling, etc) will be considered in the preparation of the final report.

14. Some member countries felt the focus of support to be provided by ADB should be on strengthening existing institutions to issue formal certificates of training in accordance with international standards. ADB supports the idea but pointed out that support may also be provided to enhance local capacity to respond quickly to field level training needs and address issues specific to particular, local situations. The proposed capacity building framework will have to be revised to accommodate both needs.

15. The participants agreed the understandings and consensus reached at the workshop and as summarized by this minutes and the attached matrix serve as good basis for further activity planning and seeking funding support, both from ADB and other developmental partners.

Training Plans by Subject

		Policy/strategic Level	Management Level	Operational Level
Customs Issues	Simplification/Harmonization of Customs Procedures			
	– WCO trade facilitation framework	Dissemination seminars Translation WCO materials into local languages		
	– Support for legislative change/legislation drafting support	Drafting skills Case studies		
	– Harmonized tariff development	Implementation best practice seminars		
	– Intellectual Property Rights	Implementation best practice seminars		Knowledge and skills
	– Customs valuation			Customs valuation audit skills
	– Rules of Origin			Understanding non-preferential rules of origin - knowledge
	ICT for Customs Modernization and Data Exchange			
	– Automated customs clearance	Best practice dissemination seminar Case studies	Process development	
	– Electronic data interchange – implementation support	Best practice dissemination seminar Case studies	Process development	
	– Data-exchange between law enforcement agencies	Best practice		
	– Use of technology			Skills development
	Risk Management, Post-Entry Audit, Customs Intelligence, Anti-drug Smuggling and other Customs Offences			

		Policy/strategic Level	Management Level	Operational Level
	– Data collection & analysis	Best practice dissemination seminars	Process development	
	– Post-customs Audit Control Procedures			Knowledge, attitude and skills training
	– Risk management approaches	Best practice Case studies		Operational risk management – knowledge & skills training
	– “non-traditional” customs control procedures: particularly drugs/terrorism/weapons	Best practice dissemination seminars Case studies		Knowledge & skills training
	– Customs Control in Free Economic Zones/Free Trade Areas	Best practice dissemination seminars Case studies	Process development	Knowledge & skills training
	– Customs Management in Logistics Hubs	Best practice dissemination seminars Case studies	Process development	Knowledge & skills training
	– Commercial Fraud Identification			Knowledge & skills training
	– Physical examination systems		Process development	Knowledge & skills training
Joint Customs Control				
	– Customs Port Management		Process development	
	– Cross-border co-operation	Best practice dissemination seminars Case studies		Knowledge skills & attitude training
Regional Transit Development				
	– TIR implementation Support	Best practice dissemination seminars	Process development	
	– Regional transit scheme pilots, include bilateral arrangements	Best practice dissemination seminars	Process development	

		Policy/strategic Level	Management Level	Operational Level
Cross-Cutting Issues	Single Window Development			
	– Single window implementation support	Strategic design	Process development	
	– Single window declarations			
	– Single Administrative Document (SAD) development			
	– Coordination between and contribution from all stakeholders			
	Special Interest			
– Systems/equipment/skills for laboratory services: e.g., plant/animal health/quality control		Process development	Knowledge and skills training	
– Energy supply control				
Integrated Trade Facilitation Issues	Trade Logistics Development			
	– Logistics skills/procedures			Knowledge & Skills training
	– Customs procedures for freight operators			Knowledge and skills training
	– Customs Control in Free Economic Zones/Free Trade Areas	Best practice dissemination seminars Case studies	Process development	Knowledge & skills training
	– Customs Management in Logistics Hubs	Best practice dissemination seminars Case studies	Process development	Knowledge & skills training
	– Supply chain security	Best practice dissemination seminars		
	– Information Technology/database operation			Skills training
	– Automated systems development	Best practice dissemination seminars Case studies	Process development	
	– Multi-modal transport: risks & liabilities			Knowledge and skills training
– New modalities of trade finance			Knowledge and skills training	

		Policy/strategic Level	Management Level	Operational Level
	- Logistics Hub implementation	Best practice dissemination seminars Case studies	Process development	
	- Free trade/economic zone operation			
	Corridor Performance Measurement and Monitoring			
	- Support for adopting monitoring methodologies			
	- Support for data analyses and reporting			
	Strengthening cooperation mechanisms and implementation capabilities			
	- National Joint Transport and Trade Facilitation Committee Support		Process development	
	- Regional Joint Transport and Trade Facilitation Committee Support		Process development	
Skills Development Issues	Skills Development			
	- Communications		Process development	Skills training
	- Language trainings (English/Russian)			Knowledge and skills training
	- training skills			Knowledge, skills and attitude training
	- Personnel management		Skills & attitude training	
	- Leadership training for trade associations		Skills & attitude training	
	- E-learning development	Best practice dissemination seminars		
	- Officer skills in relation to Trade Facilitation			Skills training
- Assessing efficiency & productivity	Best practice dissemination seminars			
- Training Needs Analysis			Knowledge and skills Training	