CAREC Readiness for Complying with the WTO TFA

A. Background

- 1. The WTO Trade Facilitation Agreement (TFA) which seeks to expedite the movement, release and clearance of goods including those in transit¹ entered into force on 22 February 2017 following its ratification by two-thirds (110 of 164) of the WTO membership. This is significant because the TFA is the first multilateral trade agreement concluded under WTO in 21 years, binds commitments from trading partners, is enforced through dispute settlement, and applies to all border agencies. It improves cooperation between customs and other authorities, and enhances technical assistance and capacity building.
- 2. The TFA also sets forth rules on special and differential treatment, linking implementation by developing and least developed countries to their acquisition of technical assistance and capacity building. Thus under Section II, such countries shall self-determine the time and means of implementing the measures in Articles 1 to 12 according to: Category A measures that the WTO member will implement upon entry into force; Category B measures for which the member will need additional time; Category C measures for which the member will need additional time which it defines and technical and/or financial assistance or capacity building to implement.
- 3. The TFA takes effect only for WTO members that have ratified it. WTO members that ratified it will implement it on a most-favored-nation (MFN) basis and continue to implement GATT Articles V (Freedom of Transit), VIII (Fees and Formalities), and X (Transparency). WTO members that have not yet ratified the TFA will only implement such GATT articles.
- 4. All 8 CAREC countries that are WTO members have ratified the TFA Afghanistan, People's Republic of China, Georgia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Republic, Mongolia, Pakistan, and Tajikistan. Except for Afghanistan, these countries also notified the WTO on their Category A designations of the TFA provisions; in addition, Georgia, has also provided Category B and C designations.

B. Revised Kyoto Convention

- 5. The International Convention on the Simplification and Harmonization of Customs Procedures (Kyoto Convention) of the World Customs Organization (WCO), entered into force in 1974. It was amended to become the Revised Kyoto Convention (RKC), which entered into force in 2006, as the blueprint for modern and efficient Customs procedures. It is the main trade facilitation instrument that provides implementation tools for the high principles set by WTO, thus compliance with it puts a country ahead in implementing the TFA.
- 6. Five CAREC countries have acceded to the RKC Azerbaijan, People's Republic of China, Kazakhstan, Mongolia, and Pakistan of which the latter four have also ratified the TFA.
- 7. A detailed comparative analysis (Wolffgang and Kafeero 2014) of the RKC and the TFA confirms that the TFA is mainly a reflection of the RKC provisions. In addition, aspects of the TFA that are not in the RKC are already taken into account by other WCO instruments and tools, such as for instance the Authorized Economic Operator program of the Standards to Secure and Facilitate Global Trade (SAFE Framework).

¹ These pertain mainly to customs procedures, as WTO negotiations on trade facilitation were launched primarily to establish agreement to simplify cross-border trade procedures.

8. The TFA provisions with their RKC chapter counterparts are in Attachment 1. The RKC comprises a Body (which defines the scope, structure, and management of the Convention), General Annex (GA), and Specific Annexes (SA). The Annexes are subdivided into chapters that contain definitions and standards, which have to be followed strictly and included in a country's customs law.

C. CAREC Compliance-Enabling Initiatives

- 9. The main CAREC activity that brings the countries closer to complying with the TFA are workshops on the RKC to inform countries of the benefits of accession, improve their understanding of the RKC provisions and built their capacity to use the available self-assessment tools. For instance, Tajikistan found that their national legislation is already largely compliant with the RKC provisions. Kyrgyz Republic did another gap analysis of their customs law in view of their recent membership with the Eurasian Economic Union.
- 10. Several other CAREC initiatives directly address a number of TFA provisions such as:
 - (i) establishment of National Joint Transport and Trade Facilitation Committees (NTFC)
 - (ii) use of information and communication technology (ICT)
 - (iii) information common exchange (ICE)
 - (iv) Corridor Performance Measurement and Monitoring (CPMM) and Time Release Study (TRS)
 - (v) CAREC Advanced Transit System (CATS)
 - (vi) authorized economic operator (AEO)
 - (vii) Single Window, joint customs control
 - (viii) Regional Improvement of Border Services (RIBS)

D. CAREC Countries' Commitments

- 11. The following are required upon entry into force by developing countries. This would include Azerbaijan, People's Republic of China, Georgia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Republic, Mongolia, Pakistan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan.
 - (i) Have an NTFC in place
 - (ii) Countries that have not done so will notify WTO of Category A designations
 - (iii) Implement Category A designations
 - (iv) Notify WTO of Category B & C designations and indicative dates for implementation; Category C will include information on technical assistance and capacity building (TACB) required to implement
 - (v) Countries declaring themselves in a position to assist other countries will submit information on the disbursed and committed TACB support
- 12. The following are required for least developed countries. This would include Afghanistan and Tajikistan.
 - (i) Have an NTFC in place
 - (ii) Start countdown for notification of Categories A, B, C designations
- 13. The establishment of NCTF or similar mechanism (Article 23.2) is among the mandatory provisions of the TFA. As of 2014, an UNCTAD (2014) inventory noted that Azerbaijan, Kyrgyz Republic, Mongolia, and Pakistan have NCTFs, while PRC has a WTO Negotiations on Trade Facilitation Support Group.

Attachment 1: The TFA Provisions with their RKC Chapter Counterparts

	TFA Provision	RKC Chapter
SE	CTION I (Expediting the movement, release,	·
	arance of goods; customs cooperation)	
1	Publication and Availability of Information	
	1.1 Publication	GA Chap 9; Standards 9.1, 9.2, 9.5, 9.9
		GA Chap 4 (Standard 4.4)
	1.2 Information available through internet	GA Chap 9; Standard 9.3
	1.3 Enquiry points	GA Chap 7 (and ITC guidelines), 9; Standards
		9.1, 9.4, 9.8
	1.4 Notification	GA Chap 3, 7, 9; Standards 9.1, 9.4, 9.8
2	Opportunity to Comment, Information Before Entry into Force and Consultations	
	2.1 Opportunity to comment and information	GA Chap 1, 9; Standard 1.3, 9.2
	before entry into force	
	2.2 Consultations	GA Chap 1, 7, 9; Standard 1.3
3	Advance rulings	GA Chap 9; Standard 9.9 and its RKC Guidelines
4	Procedures for appeal or review	GA Chap 10 and all its Standards
5	Other Measures to Enhance Impartiality, Non-	
	Discrimination and Transparency	
	5.1 Notification for enhanced controls or	GA Chap 6
	inspections	
	5.2 Detention	GA Chap 6; SA-H Chap 1
	5.3 Test procedures	GA Chap 3; Standard 3.38
6	Disciplines on Fees and Charges Imposed on	
	or in Connection with Importation and	
	Exportation	
	6.1 General disciplines on fees and charges	GA Chap 3, 9
	imposed in connection with importation and exportation	SA-A Chap 1
	6.2 Specific disciplines on fees and charges for	GA Chap 3
	customs processing imposed in connection	SA-A Chap 1
	with importation and exportation	
	6.3 Penalty disciplines	GA Chap 3
		SA-H Chap 1
7	Release and Clearance of Goods	
	7.1 Pre-arrival processing	GA Chap 3 (Standards 3.21, 3.25), Chap 7
	7.2 Electronic payment	GA Chap 7
	7.3 Separation of release from final	GA Chap 3 (Standards 3.41, 3.42, 3.43) and 5
	determination of customs duties, taxes,	
	fees and charges	CA Chan C (Ctandard C C)
	7.4 Risk management	GA Chap 6 (Standard 6.3)
	7.5 Post-clearance audit	GA Chap 6 (Standard 6.6)
	7.6 Establishment and publication of average release times	None
	7.7 Trade facilitation measures for authorized	GA Chap 3 (Standard 3.32)
	operators	The state of the s
	7.8 Expedited shipments	GA Chap 3 (Standard 3.32); immediate release
	r r -	guidelines
	7.9 Perishable goods	GA Chap 3 (Standard 3.34)
8	Border Agency Cooperation	GA Chap 3; Standard 3.35

TFA Provision	RKC Chapter				
9 Movement of Goods Intended for Import under	GA Chap 6				
Customs Control	SA-E Chap 1, 2				
10 Formalities Connected with Importation,					
Exportation and Transit					
10.1 Formalities and documentation	GA Chap 3 (Standards 3.12, 3.13, 3.15, 3.16,				
requirements	3.17, 3.19)				
10.2 Acceptance of copies	GA Chap 3 (Standards 3.16, 3.17)				
10.3 Use of international standards	GA Chap 3 (Standards 3.11), 7				
10.4 Single Window	GA Chap 3 (Standard 3.35)				
10.5 Pre-shipment inspection	None				
10.6 Use of customs brokers	GA Chap 3 (Standard 3.6, 3.7), 8				
10.7 Common border procedures and uniform	GA Chap 3 (Standards 3.11, 3.20)				
documentation					
10.8 Rejected goods	GA Chap 3 (Standard 3.26), SA-C Chap 1				
10.9 Temporary admission of goods and	GA Chap 3				
inward and outward processing	SA-G Chap 1				
	SA-F Chap 1, 2				
11 Freedom of Transit	SA-E Chap 1, 2 (on transshipment); also				
	guidelines				
12 Customs cooperation	(only general applicability)				
	GA Standard 6.7				
	GA Chap 1 and 3; SA-H Chap 1 – for measures				
	promoting compliance and cooperation;				
	GA Chap 6, & - for exchange of information				

Attachment 2: The Category A commitments of 7 CAREC countries

	ROVISION	PRC	Georgia	Kazakhstan	Kyrgyz Republic	Mongolia	Pakistan	Tajikistan
SI	ECTION I (Expediting the movement, releas	e, clearanc	e of goods; c	ustoms cooper	ation)			
1	Publication and Availability of Information							
	1.1 Publication	Α	Α				A (except j)	Α
	1.2 Information available through internet	А	А				A (except 2.1 and 2.3)	А
	1.3 Enquiry points	Α	А				A (except 3.1 and 3.4)	
	1.4 Notification	Α	А			Α	Α	
2	Opportunity to Comment, Information Before Entry into Force and Consultations							
	2.1 Opportunity to comment and information before entry into force	Α	А	A				
	2.2 Consultations	Α	А			Α		
3	Advance rulings	Α	Α					
4	Procedures for appeal or review	Α	Α	Α	Α	Α		Α
5	Other Measures to Enhance Impartiality, Non-Discrimination and Transparency							
	5.1 Notification for enhanced controls or inspections	Α	А	А				
	5.2 Detention	Α	А	Α	Α	Α	Α	Α
	5.3 Test procedures	Α	А	Α			Α	Α
6	Disciplines on Fees and Charges Imposed On or In Connection with Importation and Exportation							
	6.1 General disciplines on fees and charges imposed in connection with importation and exportation	A	A	A		A		A
	6.2 Specific disciplines on fees and charges for customs processing imposed in connection with importation and exportation	А	B (Jan 2017)	A		А	A	А

PROVISION	PRC	Georgia	Kazakhstan	Kyrgyz Republic	Mongolia	Pakistan	Tajikistan
6.3 Penalty disciplines	А	А	А			A (except 3.6)	А
7 Release and Clearance of Goods							
7.1 Pre-arrival processing	Α	Α	Α			Α	Α
7.2 Electronic payment	Α	Α					
7.3 Separation of release from final determination of customs duties, taxes, fees and charges	А	A	A			A (except 3.4 and 3.5)	A
7.4 Risk management	Α	Α	Α				Α
7.5 Post-clearance audit	Α	А	А				Α
7.6 Establishment and publication of average release times		А					А
7.7 Trade facilitation measures for authorized operators	Α	C (Dec 2018)					
7.8 Expedited shipments	Α	Α					Α
7.9 Perishable goods	Α	Α	Α				Α
8 Border Agency Cooperation	Α	A	A				A for first paragraph
9 Movement of Goods Intended for Import under Customs Control	А	А	А	А			Ā
10 Formalities Connected with Importation, Exportation and Transit							
10.1 Formalities and documentation requirements	Α	А	A		А		А
10.2 Acceptance of copies	А	А	А		А	A (except 2.1 and 2.2)	А
10.3 Use of international standards	Α	Α					Α
10.4 Single Window		А					
10.5 Pre-shipment inspection	Α	А	А	Α		А	Α
10.6 Use of customs brokers	Α	Α	Α			Α	Α
10.7 Common border procedures and uniform documentation	А	А	А		А	A (except 7.1)	А
10.8 Rejected goods	Α	А	Α		Α		Α
10.9 Temporary admission of goods and inward and outward processing		А	А				А
11 Freedom of Transit							

PROVISION	PRC	Georgia	Kazakhstan	Kyrgyz Republic	Mongolia	Pakistan	Tajikistan
11.1 Freedom of transit - regulations not restrictive	Α	А	А	A	Α		А
11.2 Freedom of transit – not conditioned on fees	Α	А	A	A	А	А	А
11.3 Freedom of transit – no voluntary restraint	Α	А	A	А	А	А	A
11.4 Freedom of transit – non- discrimination	Α	А	А	A	А	А	А
11.5 Freedom of transit – separate physical infrastructure	Α	А			А	А	А
11.6 Freedom of transit – formalities not burdensome	A	А	А		А	А	А
11.7 Freedom of transit – no unnecessary fees or delays	Α	А	A		А	А	A
11.8 Freedom of transit - no technical regulations	Α	А	A		Α	А	А
11.9 Freedom of transit – advance filing and processing	Α	C (Dec 2018)	A		А	А	А
11.10 Freedom of transit – termination of transit operation	Α	А	A		А	А	А
11.11 Freedom of transit – guarantees	Α	А	Α		Α	Α	Α
11.12 Freedom of transit – discharge of guarantee	А	А	A		A	А	А
11.13 Freedom of transit - comprehensive guarantee	Α	А			А	Α	Α
11.14 Freedom of transit - publication of information	Α	А	A		А	Α	Α
11.15 Freedom of transit – escorts	Α	Α	Α		Α	Α	Α
11.16 Freedom of transit – cooperation and coordination	Α	А	A		А		А
11.17 Freedom of transit – national transit coordinator	Α	А			А		А
12 Customs cooperation		А					