



32nd ESCC MEETING

21 April 2022

15:00-17:30 Manila time

MINUTES

<p>1.</p>	<p>Opening Remarks by CAREC Presidency and ADB (10 minutes)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mr. Ren Cong, Officer, Department of International Cooperation, National Energy Administration, People’s Republic of China • Mr. Joonho Hwang, Director Energy, Central and West Asia Department, ADB
<p>Key messages</p>	<p>Mr. Cong and Mr. Hwang welcomed the CAREC member country representatives and development partners to the 32nd ESCC Meeting.</p> <p>Mr. Cong thanked ADB for organizing the virtual ESCC meeting. He appreciates the good efforts in advancing the energy sector which is considered a key pillar in the CAREC Program and the Central Asian region. As CAREC Chair for 2022, Mr. Cong expressed China’s strong commitment to promote development and accelerate reform. He also noted that energy production has grown significantly since 2010 and explained that China developed a comprehensive value chain for renewable energy leading to significant cost reduction.</p> <p>Mr. Hwang expressed his appreciation to Mr. Ren and the whole government of PRC for their effort to lead the program through 2022. He underscored that the goal of the 32nd ESCC meeting was the completion of the first phase of implementing the CAREC Energy Strategy 2030. Mr. Hwang highlighted that all deliverables were achieved as planned under the ESCC Work Program 2020-2022 despite the hit of pandemic right at the start of the working period. Mr. Hwang highlighted the quality of results, thanking the tremendous effort and time of the CAREC members. Mr. Hwang also pointed out the important contribution of the previous CAREC presidencies within the last 3 years to achieve this goal. Lastly, Mr. Hwang introduced the agenda for the 32nd ESCC Meeting.</p>
<p>2.</p>	<p>Tour de Table (10 minutes)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Country representatives and Development Partners to introduce their names and positions and posing for a group photo thereafter
<p>Key messages</p>	<p>Working group members introduced themselves and expressed their interest in the discussion and exchange among member countries and development partners. All CAREC member countries were represented at the meeting.</p>



32nd ESCC MEETING

21 April 2022

15:00-17:30 Manila time

3.	<p>ESCC Work Program 2020-2022: Achieving a major milestone in implementing the CAREC Energy Strategy 2030 (10 minutes)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ms. Sarin Abado, CAREC Energy Focal, ADB
Key messages	<p>Ms. Abado presented the milestones achieved by the ESCC in the last 2 years including how these contribute to the main priority areas covered in the CAREC Energy Strategy 2030. Ms. Abado also provided an indicative path to 2030 and highlighted the success of the new working arrangements in the CAREC Energy Program that contains dedicated working groups and a new web portal (www.carecenergy.org) boosting visibility of the Program and quality of results.</p>
4.	<p>Presentation of ESCC Work Program Deliverables for Endorsement (30 minutes)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Concept for the new Central Asia Transmission Cooperation Association <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Ms. Gulnara Bakhtybaeva, Deputy Director of the Electric Power Development Department, Ministry of Energy of Kazakhstan (Chair of Work Stream 1) • Launch of the Virtual CAREC Energy Reform Atlas <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Mr. Bakhrom Umarbekov, Deputy Director of the Project Office for The Reform of the Electricity Industry, Ministry of Energy of Uzbekistan (Chair of Work Stream 2) • Concept for the CAREC Green Energy Alliance <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Mr. Asaf Rzayev, Head of Energy Efficiency Division of Electricity and Energy Efficiency Department, Ministry of Energy of Azerbaijan (Co-Chair of Work Stream 3)
Key messages	<p>Concept for the new Central Asia Transmission Cooperation Association</p> <p>Ms. Gulnara Bakhtybaeva, Chair of Work Stream 1 (Infrastructure Connectivity and Energy Security) presented the main features of the proposed Central Asia Transmission Cooperation Association (CATCA) including the organization’s rationale, responsibilities, organizational set-up, implementation roadmap and funding options.</p> <p>Launch of the Virtual CAREC Energy Reform Atlas</p> <p>Mr. Bakhrom Umarbekov, Chair of Work Stream 2 (Policy Reform and Liberalization) presented the virtual CAREC Energy Reform Atlas (https://atlas.carecenergy.org/) which aims at providing fast responses to policy makers on all fundamental questions of energy sector reform. Three</p>



32nd ESCC MEETING

21 April 2022

15:00-17:30 Manila time

	<p>toolkits form part of the Atlas as foreseen in the ESCC Work Program 2020-2022: (i) Tariff Reform Toolkit, (ii) Unbundling Toolkit, and (iii) Vulnerable Consumer Toolkit.</p> <p>Concept for the CAREC Green Energy Alliance</p> <p>Mr. Asaf Rzayev, Co-Chair of Work Stream 3 (Energy Efficiency and Diversification of the Energy Mix) presented the main features of the proposed new CAREC Green Energy Alliance. The Alliance is designed to be the first regional financing vehicle supporting renewable & energy efficiency project. Mr. Rzayev outlined the mechanisms, the target groups and the proposed high-level structure of the Alliance. Ms. Margalita Arabidze, Deputy Head of Energy Reforms and International Relations, Ministry of Economy and Sustainable Development of Georgia, co-chaired Work Stream 3 together with Mr. Rzayev.</p>
5.	Debriefing of Recent Events (5 minutes)
Key message	Ms. Sarin Abado debriefed ESCC members on 2 recently held flagship events: (i) the Energy Investment Forum (EIF) that took place in December 2021 discussing business opportunities in the field of Energy Efficiency and hosted the 2 nd regional energy start-up competition; and (ii) the Women in Energy Summit that took place in March 2022 launching the 1 st CAREC Women in Energy Program.
6.	CAREC Energy Outlook 2030 – Presentation of Final Version (15 minutes)
Key messages	Mr. Peter Kaznacheev, Lead Consultant from the firm Roland Berger, thanked ESCC members for the comments and useful proposals received throughout the development phase of the CAREC Energy Outlook 2030 and emphasized that all remarks have been incorporated in the final version to be published later this year. The presentation covered the content of the final paper, highlighting the main trends in the regional energy markets up to 2030 which were all assessed on two levels – aggregated for region and country-specific through: (i) Supply and demand outlook, (ii) Technology outlook, (iii) Carbon emissions outlook and (iv) Investment outlook. Mr. Kaznacheev also presented the methodology used to develop the Outlook and its various scenarios.
7.	Discussion (60 minutes)
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Member Country interventions • Development Partner interventions
Key messages	ESCC members were requested to provide answers to 3 key questions with a view to closing the ESCC work program 2020-2022: (i) Do you endorse the virtual CAREC Energy Reform Atlas; (ii) Do you agree with the features proposed for the CAREC Green Energy Alliance and the Central Asia Transmission Cooperation Association (CATCA) and (iii) Do you accept the



32nd ESCC MEETING

21 April 2022

15:00-17:30 Manila time

CAREC Energy Outlook 2030. The following summarizes the responses given by ESCC members.

1) Do you endorse the virtual CAREC Energy Reform Atlas?

CAREC members fully endorsed the CAREC Energy Reform Atlas including its overall features, toolkits and format and appreciated its value going forward.

2) Do you agree with the features proposed for the CAREC Green Energy Alliance and the Central Asia Transmission Cooperation Association (CATCA)?

CAREC members agreed to the main features proposed for the CAREC Green Energy Alliance and similarly no objections were voiced on the objective, role and set-up of CATCA. Tajikistan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan expressed that in case any further comments will arise on the CAREC Green Energy Alliance, these will be communicated soon after the meeting. *NB: No further comments were received after the meeting.*

3) Do you accept the CAREC Energy Outlook 2030.

CAREC member countries fully endorsed the CAREC Energy Outlook 2030 and appreciated the efforts that went into it and its usefulness and practicality.

Responses from Development Partners

EBRD. EBRD expressed its support of the presented reports and welcomed these initiatives being fully in line with EBRD's strategic framework, which is green, digital, and inclusive.

AIIB. AIIB expressed its gratitude to ADB and CAREC for being co-founders in regional energy projects and looks forward to doing more together in the future.

IsDB. IsDB fully supports the presented CAREC activities. It added that climate change will increasingly create water deficiencies in the region which is an area IFIs will have to draw more attention to in the future, especially when accelerating more renewable energy and hydro power projects.

CDC: CDC appreciated the efforts made in the CAREC Energy Program and highlighted that the regional shift to renewable energy will not only require adequate infrastructure for renewables but also better infrastructure for back-up fuels such as gas and especially gas transportation infrastructure. Work on issues around water shortages will also be a key issue in the years to come.



32nd ESCC MEETING

21 April 2022

15:00-17:30 Manila time

	<p>EFSD. EFSD supports the presented activities and proposed some of its regional projects to be included in the CAREC Energy Outlook and CAREC Green Energy Alliance concept note. It was agreed to take up the proposals.</p> <p>UNECE. UNECE supports the CAREC energy initiatives and expressed its gratitude to be part of the ESCC meeting for the first time. It hopes to find ways to participate further particularly in the Green Energy Alliance.</p> <p>UNDP. UNDP expressed its compliments on the presented initiatives, especially on the CAREC Energy Reform Atlas. UNDP appreciates the excellent toolkits that can be utilized on both national and regional levels and even in municipalities. UNDP also suggests promoting the Atlas to its stakeholders making it more widely known and utilized.</p> <p>CAREC INSTITUTE. CAREC Institute agreed with the deliverables presented and expressed that it is ready to play an active role in facilitating the further implementation to the best of their capacity and research conducted on regional integration issues in energy.</p> <p>USAID. USAID expressed its support to the CAREC energy initiatives and considers them attractive and promising. It was mentioned that USAID is currently supporting 3 projects under its regional mission which also enhance the CAREC Energy Agenda, these are: (i) Future Energy, (ii) Development of Regional Power Market, and (iii) Energy of Central Asia. USAID expressed its continued commitment to closely cooperate with the CAREC Energy Program in the future.</p> <p>As the Chair of the CAREC Program 2022, PRC will review all reports once more before their further submission to the CAREC Senior Officials Meeting, National Focal Points Meeting and Ministerial Conference. Any further remarks by the Chair will be incorporated in the papers.</p>
<p>8.</p>	<p>Wrap-Up and Closing (10 minutes)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mr. Ren Cong, Officer, Department of International Cooperation, National Energy Administration, People’s Republic of China • Mr. Joonho Hwang, Director Energy, Central and West Asia Department, ADB
<p>Key messages</p>	<p>Mr. Cong and Mr. Hwang thanked member countries and development partners for their active participation and support in organizing the 32nd ESCC Meeting. In closing, Mr. Cong emphasized the vast regional potential for renewable energy development and suggested to enhance policy exchange among members. Mr. Cong also suggested members to work closely together to accelerate the introduction of new and advanced energy technologies such as hydrogen and other approaches. Mr. Hwang agreed and added that this ESCC meeting was not only important to celebrate our remarkable achievements but was indeed also essential to plan the next steps. Mr. Hwang commended PRC for its leadership and congratulated the working group chairs on</p>



32nd ESCC MEETING

21 April 2022

15:00-17:30 Manila time

	their outstanding contribution and hard work to achieve the major milestones achieved in implementing the CAREC Energy Strategy 2030.
--	---

- The recording of this meeting is available on the CAREC Energy Members Area at www.carecenergy.org
- Appendix: List of Participants



32nd ESCC MEETING

21 April 2022

15:00-17:30 Manila time

Appendix

List of Participants

	Name	Position	Institution	Country
Country Representatives				
1	Asaf Rzayev	Head of Energy Efficiency Division of Electricity and Energy Efficiency Department	Ministry of Energy	Azerbaijan
2	Nazrin Habizada	Chief Adviser of the International Cooperation Department	Ministry of Energy	Azerbaijan
3	Omar Tsereteli	Renewable Energy Consultant	Georgian Energy Development Fund	Georgia
4	Nikoloz Kholodov	Senior Specialist, Division of Energy Efficiency and Renewable Energy Policy Promotion	Ministry of Economy and Sustainable Development	Georgia
5	Mariam Khotivrishvili		Ministry of Economy and Sustainable Development	Georgia
6	Teona Burdiashvili	Intern, Division of International Relations	Ministry of Economy and Sustainable Development	Georgia
7	Gulnara Bahtybayeva	Deputy Director of the Electric Power Development Department	Ministry of Energy	Kazakhstan
8	Marat Zheenbekov	Director, National Energy Policy Department	Ministry of Energy and Industry	Kyrgyz Republic
9	Mirbek Esengulov	Chief Expert, Electric Power Policy Department	Ministry of Energy	Kyrgyz Republic
10	Nurpais Sharshenaliev	Head of Legal Department	Ministry of Energy	Kyrgyz Republic
11	Puntsagbaljir B	Officer, Policy and Planning Department	Ministry of Energy	Mongolia
12	Baldorj M.	Officer, Policy and Planning Department	Ministry of Energy	Mongolia
13	Taimoor Nasir	(Joint Secretary) Transmission, Power Division	Ministry of Energy	Pakistan
14	Manzoor Ahmad	Managing Director	NTDC	Pakistan



32nd ESCC MEETING

21 April 2022

15:00-17:30 Manila time

	Name	Position	Institution	Country
15	Ren Cong	Chair of the 32 nd ESCC Meeting	Department of International Cooperation, National Energy Administration	People's Republic of China
16	Yuetao Xie	Deputy Division Director	China Renewable Energy Engineering Institute	People's Republic of China
17	Lishu Wang	Specialist	China Renewable Energy Engineering Institute	People's Republic of China
18	Manuchehr Safarzoda	Head, Main Department of Water and Energy Policy	Ministry of Energy and Water Resources	Tajikistan
19	Bayrammyrat Akmyradov	Senior Specialist	Ministry of Finance and Economy, Department for Economic Sectors Development and Finance	Turkmenistan
20	Dovlet Allayarov	Head of Agency for Development of Renewable Energy Sources	Turkmenenergo State Electricity Corporation, Ministry of Energy	Turkmenistan
21	Rustam Atliyev	Senior Specialist of Foreign Economic Relations Department and Exports	Turkmenenergo State Electricity Corporation, Ministry of Energy	Turkmenistan
22	Bahrom Umarbekov	Deputy Director, Project Office for the Reform of the Electricity Industry	Ministry of Energy	Uzbekistan
23	Holisa Nuriddinova	Chief Specialist of the Electricity Reform Office	Ministry of Energy	Uzbekistan
Development Partners				
24	Kazuhiro Nomoto		AIIB	People's Republic of China
25	Hongliang Yang	Principal Investment Operations Specialist (Energy)	AIIB	People's Republic of China
26	Syed Shakeel Shah	Director	CAREC Institute	People's Republic of China
27	Iskandar Abdullaev	Deputy Director	CAREC Institute	People's Republic of China
28	Qaisar Abbas	Head of Research Division	CAREC Institute	People's Republic of China
29	Rovshan Mahmud	Senior Capacity Building Specialist	CAREC Institute	People's Republic of China
30	Shakhboz Akhmedov	Seconded, Partnerships and Research Division	CAREC Institute	People's Republic of China
31	Ilhom Abdulloev	Officer	CAREC Institute	People's Republic of China
32	Khamidulla Shamsiev	Director	Central Dispatch Center Energiya (CDC)	Uzbekistan



32nd ESCC MEETING

21 April 2022

15:00-17:30 Manila time

	Name	Position	Institution	Country
33	David Managadze	Associate Director, Regional Head	EBRD	Georgia
34	Gennady Vasiliev	Head of Partnerships	EFSD	Central Asia
35	Yerlan Aliaskarov	Senior Project Manager	EFSD	Central Asia
36	Nadejda Khamrakulova	Project Officer	UNECE	Switzerland
37	Igor Litvinyuk	Economic Affairs Officer Secretary	UNECE	Switzerland
38	Iva Brkic	Program Officer	UNECE	Switzerland
39	Kumar Kylychev	Head Energy and Environment	UNDP	Kazakhstan
40	Oleg Khmelyov	International Technical Advisor on Green Technologies	UNDP	Kazakhstan
41	Andrey Perevertaev	Power Market Consultant	USAID CAREM Project	Kazakhstan
42	Oleg Ryaskov	Deputy Chief	USAID CAREM Project	Kazakhstan
43	Sergey Yelkin		USAID Central Asia	Kazakhstan
44	Bayan Abylkairova	Deputy Chief of Party	USAID Power Central Asia Activity	Kazakhstan
45	Ferhat Esen	Senior Energy Specialist, Europe and Central Asia Region, Energy & Extractives Global Practice	World Bank	Uzbekistan
ADB Staff, CAREC Coordinators/Advisors, Consultants				
46	Joonho Hwang	Director Energy, Central and West Asia Department	ADB	Philippines
47	Sarin Abado	Energy Specialist	ADB	Philippines
48	Areg Barseghyan	Energy Specialist	ADB	Philippines
49	Saad Paracha	Senior Regional Cooperation Specialist	ADB	Philippines
50	Ashraf Kuliyeu	Advisor to CAREC National Focal Point		Azerbaijan
51	Ekaterine Koroshinadze	CAREC Regional Cooperation Coordinator		Georgia
52	Guldana Sadykova	CAREC Regional Cooperation Coordinator		Kazakhstan
53	Diyar Tassym	Advisor to CAREC National Focal Point		Kazakhstan
54	Meder Turgunbekov	Advisor to CAREC National Focal Point		Kyrgyz Republic
55	Aidana Berdybekova	CAREC Regional Cooperation Coordinator		Kyrgyz Republic
56	Muhammad Ali	Advisor to CAREC National Focal Point		Pakistan
57	Laifei Xiong	CAREC Regional Cooperation Coordinator		People's Republic of China
58	Rustam Aminjonov	Advisor to CAREC National Focal Point		Tajikistan
59	Durdy Ilamanov	Advisor to CAREC National Focal Point		Turkmenistan



32nd ESCC MEETING

21 April 2022

15:00-17:30 Manila time

	Name	Position	Institution	Country
60	Nadir Safaev	Advisor to CAREC National Focal Point		Uzbekistan
61	Almagul Yeskendirowa	CAREC Energy Coordinator	ADB Consultant	Kazakhstan
62	Chirag Gupta	CAREC Energy Coordinator	ADB Consultant	India
63	Graeme Chown	Lead Consultant for Transmission Cooperation	ADB Consultant	Germany
64	Jannat Salimova-Tekay	Lead Consultant for Green Energy and Energy Efficiency	ADB Consultant	Kazakhstan
65	Laura Mulkibayeva	Consultant for Green Energy and Energy Efficiency	ADB Consultant	Kazakhstan
66	Peter Kaznacheev	Lead Consultant for CAREC Energy Outlook and Investment Report	ADB Consultant	UK
67	Ustym Mytsak	Consultant for CAREC Energy Outlook and Investment Report	ADB Consultant	UK
68	Lukas Hubert	Consultant for CAREC Energy Outlook and Investment Report	ADB Consultant	UK
69	Cameron O'Reilly	Lead Consultant for the Vulnerable Consumer Protection Tool of the CAREC Energy Reform Atlas	ADB Consultant	Australia
70	Barno Kurbanova	Consultant	ADB Consultant	Tajikistan