



**Central Asia Regional  
Economic Cooperation**

# 2013 CAREC Program Results Framework

*(Excerpt from the 2013 CAREC Development Effectiveness  
Review: A Refined Perspective)*

## Appendix 2

### CAREC Program Results Framework 2013

Table A2.1 Level 5 – CAREC Regional Impacts

Indicator	Indicative Target	Baseline Year	Baseline Value	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013
1. Trade openness (%) <sup>a</sup>	€	2006	67.9	62.9	64.2	67.2	66.8	...
2. Intraregional trade in total CAREC trade (%)	€	2006	6.25	6.06	6.25	5.62	6.16	6.18
3. Intraregional energy trade (GWh)	€	2006	5,061	4,435	3,544	5,304	4,752	
4. Foreign direct investment (% of GDP)	€	2006	6.0	5.3	3.8	4.3	3.9	...
5. Logistics Performance Index <sup>b</sup>	€	2010	2.53	...	2.53	...	2.46	2.43 (2014)

... = data not available, CAREC = Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation, GDP = gross domestic product, GWh = gigawatt-hour.

<sup>a</sup> No data for Afghanistan and Turkmenistan. Series changed from using 2000 to 2005 constant \$.

<sup>b</sup> The Logistics Performance Index score ranges from 1 for worst to 5 for best.

Notes: Data sources constantly revise their estimates to incorporate more recent information; hence, figures will vary from those in the earlier development effectiveness reviews. Comparable subnational data for the Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region and the Inner Mongolia Autonomous Region of the People's Republic of China are not available for these indicators.

Sources: World Bank. World Development Indicators Online Database, for indicators 1 and 4; International Monetary Fund. *Direction of Trade Statistics* for indicator 2; Coordinating Dispatch Center, Tashkent, Uzbekistan, for indicator 3; and World Bank. *Connecting to Compete 2012: Trade Logistics in the Global Economy. The Trade Logistics Performance Index and Its Indicators*, for indicator 5.

Table A2.2. Level 4 – CAREC Priority Sector Outcomes

Indicator	Baseline Year	Baseline Value	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2013 Target	2013 Progress
Time taken to clear a border crossing (hours)	2010	8.7	...	8.7	7.9	10.9	10.0	€	G
Costs incurred at a border-crossing clearance (\$)	2010	186	...	186	156	157	235	€	G
Speed of travel on a 500 km CAREC corridor section (km per hour) <sup>a</sup>	2010	24	...	24	22	23	20	€	A
Costs incurred in traveling a corridor section (\$, per 500 km, per 20-ton load)	2010	712	...	712	959	999	1,482	€	G

... = data not available, CAREC = Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation, km = kilometer.

<sup>a</sup> Speed is measured "with delays" for a 20-ton truck or a 20-foot equivalent unit container.

Source: CAREC Corridor Performance Measurement and Monitoring Annual Reports, 2010–2013.

Table A2.3 Level 3 – CAREC Priority Sector Outputs

Indicator	Baseline Year	Baseline Value	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2013 Target	2013 Progress
Annual expressways or national highways built or improved (km)	2008	177	254	1,154	953	1,116	1,312	1,200	G
Cumulative proportion of total CAREC corridor built or improved (%) <sup>a</sup>	2008	64	66	71	75	79	85	80	G

CAREC = Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation, km = kilometer.

<sup>a</sup> This may overstate overall road conditions due to deterioration of some road sections that were rated to be in good condition in 2007.

Source: Transport Sector Coordinating Committee, Transport Sector Progress Report, 5 November 2014.

Table A2.4. Level 2 – Operational and Organizational Effectiveness

Indicator	Indicative Target	Baseline Year	Baseline Value	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2013 Progress
Volume of approved investment projects, cumulative since 2001 (\$ million)	€	2006	3,107 <sup>a</sup>	12,504 <sup>a</sup>	15,388	17,806	21,237	22,410	G
Number of approved investment projects, cumulative since 2001	€	2006	41	92	108	125	136	146	G
Average volume of newly approved investment projects (3-year moving average, \$ million) <sup>b</sup>	€	2006	594	3,133	3,635	3,386	2,910	2,341	G
Ratings of CAREC-related technical assistance projects completed (% successful)	€	2006	86	90	83	100	90	100	G
Participants in CAREC-supported training programs (person-days)	€	2009	1,825	...	1,349	1,582	1,328	953	

... = no data available, CAREC = Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation.

<sup>a</sup> Figures include only the disbursed tranches of multitranche financing facility investments.

<sup>b</sup> 2006 reflects data for 2004–2006; 2010 for 2008–2010; 2011 for 2009–2011; 2012 for 2010–2012; and 2013 for 2011–2013. Note:

Figures in earlier development effectiveness reviews have been adjusted to reflect updated project information.

Source: CAREC Program Portfolio.

## APPENDIX 3

### Results Framework Definitions and Sources

Indicator	Definition and Source
Trade openness (%)	<p><b>Definition:</b> Trade openness is measured using the trade volume approach where export and import of goods and services are divided by gross domestic product (GDP) in constant \$ price [(exports+imports)/GDP]. This method allows time series analysis of results.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> World Bank. World Development Indicators Online.</p>
Intraregional trade in total CAREC trade (%)	<p><b>Definition:</b> The ratio of total trade of CAREC countries with each other to the CAREC countries' total trade with the world. Total trade is the sum of exports and imports. The higher the ratio, the more integrated the CAREC countries are.</p> <p><b>Source of basic data:</b> International Monetary Fund. Direction of Trade Statistics.</p>
Intraregional energy trade (GWh)	<p><b>Definition:</b> Total volume of regional electric trade in gigawatt-hours (GWh) of CAREC members Afghanistan, Kazakhstan, the Kyrgyz Republic, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> Central Dispatch Center, Tashkent, Uzbekistan.</p>
Foreign direct investment (% of GDP)	<p><b>Definition:</b> International investment that obtains a lasting interest (at least 10%) in an enterprise resident in another economy. The components of foreign direct investment (FDI) are equity capital, reinvested earnings, and other capital (mainly intra-company loans). As countries do not always collect data for each of these components, reported data on FDI are not fully comparable across countries. In particular, data on reinvested earnings, the collection of which depends on company surveys, are often unreported by many countries.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> World Bank. World Development Indicators Online.</p>
Logistics Performance Index	<p><b>Definition:</b> A weighted average of the country scores on six key dimensions: (1) efficiency of clearance process by border control agencies, (2) quality of trade and transport-related infrastructure, (3) ease of arranging competitively- priced shipments, (4) competence and quality of logistics services, (5) ability to track and trace consignments, (6) frequency with which shipments reach the consignee within the scheduled or expected delivery time. Scores can range from 1 for low to 5 for high performance.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> World Bank. 2012. <i>Connecting to Compete: Trade Logistics in the Global Economy. The Trade Logistics Performance Index and Its Indicators.</i></p>
Expressways or national highways built or improved (km)	<p><b>Definition:</b> Length of expressways (i.e., fully access-controlled highways) built or improved, expressed in kilometers (km). Access control means no direct crossings. Expressways can include roads that in certain countries are called highways if they have full access control. "Improving" includes all activity to restore a degraded road to the originally intended design capacity (repair/rehabilitation) and to improve on its design capacity (e.g., by widening). "Improving" cannot be applied in cases where only road signage is enhanced.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> Transport Sector Coordinating Committee, Country Reports for transport indicators.</p>

*continued on next page*

Table 13 *continued*

Proportion of total CAREC corridor built or improved (%)	<p><b>Definition:</b> Percentage total of all CAREC road corridors built or improved through CAREC investment activities that meet appropriate international roughness index standards. Road should be open to public use.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> Transport Sector Coordinating Committee, Country Reports for transport indicators.</p>
Time taken to clear a border crossing (hours)	<p><b>Definition:</b> The average duration taken to move cargo from an exit point of a country to an entry point of another country. The entry and exit points are typically a primary control center where customs, immigration, and quarantine checks are done. Besides the standard formalities to clear them, this measurement also includes waiting time, unloading and loading time, change of rail gauges and so forth, to capture both complexity and inefficiencies inherent in the border-crossing process. The indicator is normalized at 500 km as a basis of unit, so that duration between long and short corridors is comparable.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> CAREC Corridor Performance Measurement and Monitoring (CPMM) Reports.</p>
Costs incurred at a border-crossing clearance (\$)	<p><b>Definition:</b> The average of total expenses (\$) to move cargo from an exit point of a country to an entry point of another country. The entry and exit points are typically a primary control center where customs, immigration, and quarantine checks are done. Both official and unofficial payments are included. The indicator is normalized at 500 km as a basis of unit, so that average cost between long and short corridors is comparable.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> CAREC CPMM Reports.</p>
Speed of travel on a 500 km CAREC corridor section (km per hour)	<p><b>Definition:</b> The average speed for a unit of cargo to travel within the country and across borders. A unit of cargo refers to a cargo truck with 20 tons of goods (for road transport) or a rail wagon with one 20-foot equivalent unit (for rail transport). Speed is calculated by taking the total distances traveled divided by the total time taken; both distance and time include border crossings.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> CAREC CPMM Reports.</p>
Costs incurred in traveling a corridor section (\$, per 500 km, per 20-ton load)	<p><b>Definition:</b> The average of total costs “with delays” incurred for a unit of cargo to travel within the country and across borders. A unit of cargo refers to a cargo truck with 20 tons of goods (for road transport) or a rail wagon with one 20-foot equivalent unit (for rail transport). Both official and unofficial payments are included.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> CAREC CPMM Reports.</p>
Volume of approved investment projects, cumulative since 2001 (\$ million)	<p><b>Definition:</b> Total volume of approved CAREC-related projects, jointly financed by CAREC governments and multilateral institution partners, cumulative since 2001.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> CAREC Program Portfolio, CAREC multilateral partner online project databases.</p>
Number of approved Investment projects, cumulative since 2001	<p><b>Definition:</b> Number of approved CAREC-related projects, jointly financed by CAREC governments and multilateral institution partners, cumulative since 2001.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> CAREC Program Portfolio, CAREC multilateral partner online project databases.</p>
Average volume of newly approved investment projects (3-year moving average, \$ million)	<p><b>Definition:</b> Total volume of CAREC-related projects (loans and grants) from all CAREC partner multilateral institutions and country governments, approved during the 12-month period under review.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> CAREC Program Portfolio, CAREC multilateral partner online project databases.</p>

*continued on next page*

Table 13 *continued*

Ratings of CAREC-related technical assistance projects completed (% <i>successful</i> )	<p><b>Definition:</b> Number of completion reports issued for CAREC-related technical assistance projects in the review period with <i>successful</i> or better ratings, as a percentage of total technical assistance completion reports circulated in the same year. Technical assistance projects that lead and/or contribute directly to investment projects are also counted as <i>successful</i>, since these often do not have completion reports.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> CAREC Program Portfolio, CAREC-related project completion and validation reports, CAREC multilateral institution partners online project databases.</p>
Participants in CAREC-supported training programs (person-days)	<p><b>Definition:</b> Total count of individuals successfully completing CAREC- sponsored training programs during the 12-month period under review, multiplied by the total number of days.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> CAREC Program website.</p>

