



**Central Asia
Regional Economic
Cooperation**

2011 CAREC Program Results Framework

*(Excerpt from the 2011 Central Asia Regional Economic
Cooperation Program Development Effectiveness Review:
Toward CAREC 2020—Focus, Action, Results)*

APPENDIX 1: CAREC PROGRAM RESULTS FRAMEWORK 2011

Table A1.1: Level 1—CAREC Region Development Outcomes

Indicator	Indicative Target	Baseline Year	Baseline Value	2008	2009	2010/ Latest Value	2011 Progress
1. Population living on less than \$2 a day (%)	↓	2002	65.3 ^a	52.1 ^{a,b}	50.1	...	G
2. Human Development Index	↑	2000	0.524	0.573	0.599 ^c	0.612 ^d	G
3. Gender Inequality Index	↓	2010	0.614 ^e	0.436 ^{d,e}	G
4. GDP per capita PPP (constant 2005 international \$)	↑	2006	2,643	2,884	2,964	3,072	G
5. GDP PPP (constant 2005 international \$ billion)	↑	2006	242.8	262.6	272.7	284.7	G
6. Real GDP growth rate (%)	↑	2006	11.1 ^a	8.1	4.1 ^a	5.4	G
7. Labor force participation rate (%)	↑	2006	57.7	57.7	58.2	...	G
8. Women employed in nonagriculture sector (%)	↑	2006	38.6 ^{a,f}	38.0 ^{a,f,g}	37.9 ^h	...	R
9. Real growth in trade of goods and services (%)	↑	2006 ^h	12.5 ^h	7.2	(3.9) ^{g,i}	...	R
10. Trade openness (%) ^f	↑	2006	0.547 ^j	0.561 ^j	0.509 ^j	0.514 ^j	G
11. Intraregional energy trade (GWh)	↑	2006	5,061	4,227	4,435	...	G
12. GDP per unit of energy use (2005 PPP \$ per kilogram of oil equivalent)	↑	2006	3.0 ^a	3.6 ^a	4.0 ^a	...	G
13. Foreign direct investment (% GDP)	↑	2006	2.5	4.2	4.9	4.2	A
14. Time required to start a business (days)	↓	2006	31 ^k	17 ^k	15 ^k	15 ^{d,k}	A
15. Cost of business start-up procedures (% GNI per capita)	↓	2006	26.6 ^k	10.9 ^k	12.2 ^k	10.8 ^{d,k}	G

... = data not available, () = negative, GDP = gross domestic product, GNI = gross national income, GWh = gigawatt-hour; PPP = purchasing power parity.

^a No data for Afghanistan.

^b 2005 data.

^c 2010 data.

^d 2011 data.

^e No data for Turkmenistan or Uzbekistan.

^f No data for Uzbekistan.

^g Includes 2007 data.

^h 2008 data.

ⁱ No data for Mongolia.

^j No data for Afghanistan, Mongolia, or Turkmenistan.













^k For indicators 14 and 15, 2009 data is shown under the year 2008; 2010 data is under the year 2009; and 2011 data is under the year 2010/Latest Value column. No data for Turkmenistan.

Notes: Comparable subnational data for Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region and Inner Mongolia Autonomous Region of the People's Republic of China are not available.

Sources: World Bank. PovcalNet Online Database for indicator 1; United Nations Development Programme. 2011. *Human Development Report 2011*. New York, for indicators 2 and 3. World Development Indicators Online Database for indicators 4–8, 10, and 12–13; World Bank. World

Trade Indicators Online Database for indicator 9; Central Dispatch Center, Tashkent, Uzbekistan, 2011, for indicator 11; International Finance Corporation/World Bank Doing Business Online Database, for indicators 14 and 15.

Table A1.2: Level 2—CAREC Priority Sector Outputs

Indicator	Baseline Year	Baseline Value	2009	2010	2011	2017 Target	2011 Progress
Transport and Trade Facilitation							
Expressways or national highways built or improved (km)	2008	177	1,288	1,025	1,022	8,640	
Proportion of total CAREC road corridor built or improved (%)	2008	65	70	74	79	100	
Time taken to clear a border crossing (hours)	2010	8.7	7.9		
Costs incurred at a border-crossing clearance (\$)	2010	186	156		
Speed to travel 500 km on CAREC corridor section (km per hour) ^a	2010	24	22		
Costs incurred to travel corridor section (\$)	2010	712	959		
Trade Policy							
CAREC Trade Liberalization Index	2009	(1.8)		5.5	12.8	20.0 ^b	
Energy							
Transmission lines installed or upgraded (km)	2009	850	1,150	1,200 ^c	
Increased energy generation capacity (MW)

... = no data available, () = negative, CAREC = Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation, km = kilometer; MW = megawatt.

^a Speed is measured here 'with delays' for a 20-ton truck or a 20-foot equivalent unit container (Appendix 4).

^b Target year is 2012.

^c The total 1,200 km represents expected output over 2012–2015.

Sources: Transport and Trade Facilitation Coordinating Committee, Country Progress Reports for transport indicators; CAREC Corridor Performance Measurement and Monitoring Quarterly and Annual Reports, 2009–2010, for trade facilitation indicators; Trade Policy Strategic Action Plan monitoring questionnaire, 2010; and ADB project completion and validation reports, and World Bank online project databases for energy indicators.

Table A1.3: Level 3—Operational and Organizational Effectiveness

Indicator	Indicative Target	Baseline Year	Baseline Value	2009	2010	2011	2011 Progress
Volume of approved investment projects (loans and grants, cumulative since 2001, \$ million)	↑	2006	3,108 ^a	12,506 ^a	15,694	17,696	G
Number of investment projects approved (loans and grants, cumulative since 2001)	↑	2006	41	91	107	122	G
Number of completed investment projects (cumulative since 2001)	↑	2006	3	14	23	36	G
Annual average volume of new approved investment projects (loans and grants, 3-year rolling average, \$ million)	↑	2006	595 ^b	3,133 ^b	3,736 ^b	3,349 ^b	A
<i>CAREC technical assistance project financing gap (\$ '000)</i>
Ratings of CAREC-related technical assistance projects completed (% successful)	↑	2006	89	94	88	93	G
<i>[Knowledge production and dissemination: pending]</i>
Participants in CAREC-supported training programs (number of person days)	↑	2009	1,825	...	1,199	1,582	G

... = no data available, CAREC = Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation Program.

^a Figures include only disbursed tranches of multifinancing facility investments.

^b Figures that appeared in the 2010 CAREC DEfR have been adjusted to reflect updated project information.

Sources: CAREC Program Portfolio, CAREC Institute, and CAREC Website Unit.

APPENDIX 2: RESULTS FRAMEWORK DEFINITIONS AND SOURCES

Table A2.1: Level 1—CAREC Region Development Outcomes

Indicator	Definition and Source
Poverty Reduction	
Population living below \$2/day	Definition: Percentage of the population living on less than \$2-a-day measured at 2005 international prices adjusted for purchasing power parity (PPP). The \$2-a-day poverty line is compared to consumption or income per person and includes consumption from own production and income in kind. Source: World Bank PovcalNet Online. April 2012.
Human Development Index	Definition: The Human Development Index (HDI) is a composite index measuring average achievement in three basic dimensions of human development—a long and healthy life (life expectancy at birth); access to knowledge (mean years of schooling, and expected years of schooling); and a decent standard of living (GNI per capita [PPP \$]). The HDI provides a single statistic as a frame of reference for both social and economic development. The HDI sets a minimum and a maximum for each dimension, called goalposts, and then shows where each country stands in relation to these goalposts, expressed as a value between 0 and 1. Source: United Nations Development Programme. <i>Human Development Reports</i> . New York.
Gender Inequality Index	Definition: The Gender Inequality Index (GII) reflects women's disadvantage in three dimensions—reproductive health, empowerment, and the labor market. The index shows the loss in human development due to inequality between female and male achievements in these dimensions. It ranges from 0, which indicates that women and men fare equally, to 1, which indicates that women fare worse in all measured dimensions. Source: United Nations Development Programme. <i>Human Development Report 2012</i> . New York.
Gross Domestic Product, Trade, and Business Development	
GDP per capita PPP (\$)	Definition: Gross domestic product (GDP) per capita is the sum of gross value added by all resident producers in the economy plus any product taxes and minus any subsidies not included in the value of the products, divided by population. Calculated without deductions for depreciation of fabricated assets or for depletion and degradation of natural resources and at market prices based on constant local currency. Source: World Bank. World Development Indicators Online. April 2012.
GDP PPP (constant 2005 international \$ billion)	Definition: GDP is the sum of value added by all resident producers plus any product taxes (less subsidies) not included in the valuation of output. Growth is calculated from constant price GDP data in local currency. Source: World Bank. World Development Indicators Online. April 2012.
Real GDP growth rate (%)	Definition: Average annual growth of sum of value added by all resident producers in the economy plus any product taxes (less subsidies) not included in the valuation of output, calculated without making deductions for depreciation of fabricated capital assets for depletion and degradation of natural resources, expressed in PPP US dollar terms. Source: World Bank. World Development Indicators Online. April 2012.
Labor force participation rate (%)	Definition: Percentage of the working-age population (ages 15–64) that actively engages in the labor market by either working or actively looking for work. Source: World Development Indicators Online. April 2012.
Women employed in nonagriculture sector (%)	Definition: Share of female workers in nonagriculture sector expressed as a percentage of total employment in the sector. Nonagriculture sector includes industry and services. Following the International Standard Industrial Classification of All Economic Activities, "industry" includes mining and quarrying (including oil production), manufacturing, construction, electricity, gas, and water. "Services" includes wholesale and retail trade; restaurants and hotels; transport, storage, and communications; financing, insurance, real estate and business services; and community, social, and personal services. Source: World Bank. World Development Indicators Online. April 2012.
Real growth in trade of goods and services (%)	Definition: Average annual growth rate of total exports and imports in goods and services, deflated by import and export prices maintained by Development Prospects Group 2000. This indicator reflects the trade expansion of a country over the period. Source: World Bank. World Trade Indicators Online. April 2012.
Trade openness (%)	Definition: Trade openness is measured using the trade volume approach where export and import of goods and services are divided by GDP in constant \$ price (exports+imports/GDP). This methodology allows time series analysis of results.

Indicator	Definition and Source
Gross Domestic Product, Trade, and Business Development	
Intraregional energy trade (GWh)	<p>Definition: Total volume of regional electric trade in gigawatt-hours (GWh) of CAREC members Afghanistan, Kazakhstan, the Kyrgyz Republic, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan.</p> <p>Source: Central Dispatch Center, Tashkent, Uzbekistan, May 2012.</p>
GDP per unit of energy use (2005 PPP \$ per kilogram of oil equivalent)	<p>Definition: The ratio of GDP to energy use indicates energy efficiency. GDP per unit of energy use is the ratio of gross domestic product per kilogram of oil equivalent of energy use, with GDP converted to 2005 constant international dollars using PPP rates. An international dollar has the same purchasing power over GDP that a dollar has in the United States. Energy use refers to the use of primary energy before transmission to other end-use fuel, which is indigenous production plus imports and stock changes minus exports and fuel supplied to ships and aircraft engaged in international transport.</p> <p>Source: World Bank. World Development Indicators Online. April 2012.</p>
Foreign direct investment, net inflows (% GDP)	<p>Definition: International investment that obtains a lasting interest (at least 10%) in an enterprise resident in another economy. The components of foreign direct investment (FDI) are equity capital, reinvested earnings and other capital (mainly intra-company loans). As countries do not always collect data for each of those components, reported data on FDI are not fully comparable across countries. In particular, data on reinvested earnings, the collection of which depends on company surveys, are often unreported by many countries.</p> <p>Source: World Bank. World Development Indicators Online. April 2012.</p>
Time required to start a business (days)	<p>Definition: The cost, as a percentage of the economy's per capita income, including all official fees and fees for legal or professional fees, fees for purchasing and legalizing company books, if such services are required by law for an entrepreneur to start up and formally operate an industrial or commercial business.</p> <p>Source: International Finance Corporation/World Bank. Doing Business Online. April 2012.</p>
Cost of business start-up procedures (% GNI per capita)	<p>Definition: The time, in calendar days, needed to complete the required procedures for legally operating a business. If a procedure can be expedited at additional cost, the fastest procedure, independent of cost, is chosen. The measure captures the median duration that incorporation lawyers indicate is necessary to complete a procedure with minimum follow-up with government agencies and no extra payments. The minimum time required for each procedure is one day and, although procedures may take place simultaneously, they cannot start on the same day. A procedure is considered complete once the company has received the final document.</p> <p>Source: International Finance Corporation/World Bank. Doing Business Online. April 2012.</p>

CAREC = Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation, GNI = gross national income.

Table A2.2: Level 2—CAREC Priority Sector Outputs

Indicator	Definition and Source
Transport and Trade Facilitation Sectors	
Expressways or national highways built or improved (km)	Definition: Length of expressways (i.e., fully access-controlled highways) built or improved, expressed in kilometer (km). Access control means no direct crossings. "Expressways" can include roads that in certain countries are called highways if they have full access control. "Improving" includes all activity to restore a degraded road to originally intended design capacity (repair/rehabilitation) and to improve on its design capacity (e.g. by widening). "Improving" cannot be applied in cases where only road signage is improved. Source: Transport Sector Coordinating Committee, Country Reports for transport indicators.
Proportion of total CAREC road corridor built or improved (%)	Definition: Percentage total of all CAREC road corridors built or improved through CAREC investment activities that meet appropriate international roughness index standards. Road should be open to public use. Source: Transport Sector Coordinating Committee, Country Reports for transport indicators.
Time taken to clear a border crossing (minutes)	Definition: The average duration (in minutes) taken to move cargo from an exit point of a country to the entry point of another country. The entry and exit points are typically a primary control center where customs, immigration, and quarantine are done. Besides the standard formalities to clear customs, immigration, and quarantine, this measurement also includes waiting time, unloading and loading time, change of rail gauges and so forth, to capture both complexity and inefficiencies inherent in the border-crossing process. This indicator is normalized at 500 km as a basis of unit, so that duration between long and short corridors is comparable. Source: CAREC Corridor Performance Measurement and Monitoring (CPMM) Reports.
Costs incurred at a border-crossing clearance (\$)	Definition: The average of total expenses (\$) to move cargo from an exit point of a country to the entry point of another country. The entry and exit points are typically a primary control center where customs, immigration, and quarantine are done. Both official and unofficial payments are included. This indicator is normalized at 500 km as a basis of unit, so that average cost between long and short corridors is comparable. Source: CAREC CPMM Reports.
Speed to travel 500 km on CAREC Corridor section (kph)	Definition: The average speed for a unit of cargo to travel within the country and across borders. A unit of cargo refers to a cargo truck with 20 tons of goods (for road transport) or a rail wagon with one 20-foot equivalent unit (for rail transport). Speed is calculated by taking the total distance traveled divided by the total time taken; both distance and time include border crossings. Source: CAREC CPMM Reports.
Costs incurred to travel corridor section(\$)	Definition: The average of total costs "with delays" incurred for a unit of cargo to travel within the country and across borders. A unit of cargo refers to a cargo truck with 20 tons of goods (for road transport) or a rail wagon with one 20-foot equivalent unit (for rail transport). Both official and unofficial payments are included. Source: CAREC CPMM Reports.
Trade Policy Sector	
CAREC trade liberalization index	Definition: Composite indicator measuring achievement in prioritized actions leading toward effective trade liberalization, as a first step in the process of World Trade Organization accession. Progress is monitored in the following areas: (i) tariffication of quantitative restrictions, (ii) tariff simplification, and (iii) reduction of impediments to transit trade. Source: Data are extracted from an annual International Monetary Fund–conducted questionnaire survey of CAREC partners.
Energy Sector	
Transmission lines installed or upgraded (km)	Definition: Transmission lines ≥ 110 kilovolt (some countries may report only ≥ 220 kilovolt, which was accepted by the committee because it will under-report performance), constructed or upgraded (km). Source: Energy Sector Coordinating Committee, CAREC-related project completion and validation reports, and CAREC multilateral institution online project databases.
Increased energy generation capacity (MW)	Definition: Increased energy generation capacity (expressed in megawatts) is incremental capacity created by the project, and the aggregate of the following categories: (i) MW capacity of new power plant projects, (ii) incremental MW as the result of rehabilitation project, and (iii) MW-equivalent capacity of heating supply added. Source: Energy Sector Coordinating Committee, CAREC-related project completion and validation reports, and CAREC multilateral institution online project databases.

CAREC = Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation, kph = kilometer per hour, MW = megawatt.

Table A2.3: Level 3—Operational and Organizational Effectiveness

Indicator	Definition
Operations Growth	
Volume of approved investment projects (loans and grants; cumulative since 2001, \$ million)	Total volume of approved CAREC-related projects, jointly financed by CAREC governments and multilateral institution partners, cumulative since 2001.
Number of investment projects approved (loans and grants, cumulative since 2001)	Number of approved CAREC-related projects, jointly financed by CAREC governments and multilateral institution partners, cumulative since 2001.
Number of completed investment projects (cumulative since 2001)	Number of multilateral institution–validated project completion reports.
Finance Mobilization	
Annual average volume of new approved investment projects (loans and grants, 3-year rolling average, \$ million)	Total volume of CAREC-related projects (loans and grants) from all CAREC partner multilateral institutions and country governments, approved during 12-month period under review.
CAREC technical assistance financing gap (\$ '000)	Outstanding funding gap for proposed/approved priority sector technical assistance projects, forecast for current 12-month period.
Knowledge Management	
Ratings of CAREC-related technical assistance projects completed (% successful)	Number of completion reports issued for CAREC-related technical assistance projects in the review period with “successful or better” ratings as a percentage of total technical assistance completion reports circulated in the same year. Technical assistance projects that lead and/or contribute directly to investment projects—and which often do not have completion reports—are counted as “successful.”
Knowledge sharing and dissemination: work-in-progress	Pending.
Participants in CAREC-supported training programs (# person days)	Total count of individuals successfully completing CAREC-sponsored training programs during 12-month period under review.

CAREC = Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation.

Sources: CAREC Program project portfolio, CAREC-related project completion and validation reports, CAREC multilateral institution partner online project databases, CAREC website.