



**Central Asia  
Regional Economic  
Cooperation**

# 2010 CAREC Program Results Framework

## 2010 CAREC PROGRAM RESULTS FRAMEWORK

### Level 1—CAREC Region Development Outcomes

Indicator	Indicative Target	Baseline Year	Baseline Value	2008	2009/Latest Value	Progress
1. Population living on less than \$2 a day (%)	↓	2002	52.3 <sup>a</sup>	42.4 <sup>a,b</sup>	...	G
2. Human Development Index	↑	2000	0.507	...	0.599 <sup>c</sup>	G
3. Gender Inequality Index	↑	2010	0.577 <sup>d</sup>	0.577 <sup>d</sup>	...	...
4. GDP per capita PPP (constant 2005 international \$)	↑	2006	3,302	3,796	3,943	G
5. GDP PPP (constant 2005 international \$ billion)	↑	2006	53.9	63.2	67.5	G
6. Real GDP growth rate (%)	↑	2006	11.8 <sup>a</sup>	...	3.8 <sup>a</sup>	A
7. Labor force participation rate (%)	↑	2006	63.5	64.4	...	G
8. Women employed in nonagricultural sector (%)	↑	2006	48.6 <sup>a,d</sup>	51 <sup>a,d,e</sup>	...	G
9. Real growth in trade of goods and services (%)	↑	2006	12.1 <sup>f</sup>	...	(2.8) <sup>f</sup>	A
10. Trade openness (%)	↑	2006	0.8 <sup>a,f</sup>	...	0.9 <sup>a,f</sup>	G
11. Intra-regional energy trade (GWh)]	↑	2006	5,061	4,227	4,435	G
12. GDP per unit of energy use (2005 PPP \$ per kilogram of oil equivalent)	↑	2006	3.0 <sup>a</sup>	3.7 <sup>a</sup>	...	G
13. Foreign direct investment (% GDP)	↑	2006	4.3	6.3	5.9	A
14. Time required to start a business (days)	↓	2006	32 <sup>h</sup>	16 <sup>g,h</sup>	14 <sup>c</sup>	G
15. Cost of business start-up procedures (% GNI per capita)	↓	2006	27.4	11.7 <sup>g</sup>	12.4 <sup>c</sup>	A

... = no data available; ( ) = negative; GDP = gross domestic product; GNI = gross domestic income; GWh = gigawatt hour; PPP = purchasing power parity.

<sup>a</sup> No data for Afghanistan.

<sup>b</sup> 2005 data.

<sup>c</sup> 2010 data.

<sup>d</sup> No data for Uzbekistan.

<sup>e</sup> Includes 2007 data.

<sup>f</sup> No data for Mongolia.

<sup>g</sup> 2009 data.

<sup>h</sup> The change in the 2006 baseline and the 2009 value for this indicator (from 31 to 32, and 14 to 16, respectively) is because of upward adjustment of data that has become available since the *2009 CAREC DEIR* through the online databases of the IFC/World Bank's *Doing Business* publication.

Notes: Comparable subnational data for Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region and Inner Mongolia Autonomous Region are not available.

Sources: World Bank. PovcalNet Online Database for indicator 1; United Nations Development Programme. 2011. *Human Development Report 2010*. New York and Geneva, for indicators 2 and 3; World Bank. World Development Indicators Online Database for indicators 4-8, 10, and 12-13; World Bank. World Trade Indicators Online Database for indicator 9; Central Dispatch Center, Tashkent, Uzbekistan, 2011, for indicator 11; and International Finance Corporation/World Bank Doing Business Online Database, for indicators 14 and 15.

## Level 2—CAREC Priority Sector Outputs

Indicator	Indicative Target	Baseline Year	Baseline Value	2009	2010	Progress
<i>Transport and Trade Facilitation Sector</i>						
Expressways or national highways built or improved (km)	↑	2008	196	791	1,078	G
Proportion of total CAREC road corridor built or improved (%)	↑	2008	2	10	13	G
Time taken to clear a border crossing (hours)	↓	2009	11	...	13	A
Costs incurred at a border crossing clearance (\$)	↓	2009	282	...	278	G
Speed to travel 500 km on CAREC corridor section (km per hour) <sup>a</sup>	↑	2009	20	...	17	A
Costs incurred to travel corridor section (\$)	↓	2009	873	...	1,248	A
<i>Trade Policy Sector</i>						
CAREC Trade Liberalization Index	↑	2009	(1.8)	...	5.5	G
<i>Energy Sector</i>						
Transmission lines installed or upgraded (km)	↑	2009	580	...	...	A
Increased energy generation capacity (MW)	↑	2009	...	...	...	...

... = no data available; ( ) = negative; CAREC = Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation; km = kilometer; MW = megawatt

<sup>a</sup> Speed is measured here 'with delays' for a 20-ton truck or a 20-foot equivalent unit container.

Sources: Transport and Trade Facilitation Coordinating Committee, Country Progress Reports for transport indicators; CAREC Corridor Performance Measurement and Monitoring Quarterly and Annual Reports, 2009-2010, for trade facilitation indicators; Trade Policy Strategic Action Plan monitoring questionnaire, 2010; and ADB project completion and validation reports, and World Bank online project databases for energy indicators.

### Level 3—Operational and Organizational Effectiveness

Indicator	Indicative Target	Baseline Year	Baseline Value	2009	2010	Progress
Volume of approved investment projects (loans and grants, cumulative since 2001, \$ million)	↑	2006	3,228 <sup>a</sup>	12,217 <sup>a,b</sup>	14,980	G
Number of investment projects approved (loans and grants, cumulative since 2001)	↑	2006	43	95	110	G
Number of completed investment projects (cumulative since 2001)	↑	2006	1 <sup>c</sup>	13 <sup>c</sup>	22	G
Annual average volume of new approved investment projects (loans and grants, 3-year rolling average, \$ million)	↑	2006	628 <sup>d</sup>	2,997 <sup>d</sup>	3,459	G
<i>CAREC technical assistance project financing gap (\$ '000)</i>	...	...	...	...	...	...
Ratings of CAREC-related technical assistance projects completed (% successful)	↑	2006	82	89	50	A
<i>[Knowledge production and dissemination: pending]</i>	...	...	...	...	...	...
Participants in CAREC-supported training programs (number of person days)	↑	2009	1,825	1,825	1,199	A

... = no data available; CAREC = Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation Program.

<sup>a</sup> Figures include only disbursed tranches of multifinancing facility investments.

<sup>b</sup> Figures that appeared in the 2009 CAREC DEIR have been adjusted to reflect updated project information.

<sup>c</sup> Figures that appeared in the 2009 CAREC DEIR have been adjusted to reflect revised indicator calculation methodology.

<sup>d</sup> Figures that appeared in the 2009 CAREC DEIR have been adjusted to reflect updated project information.

Note: Where rolling averages are used to flatten unrepresentative spikes and dips in data, 2006 reflects data for 2004–2006, 2009 reflects data for 2007–2009, and 2010 reflects data for 2008–2010.

Sources: CAREC Program Portfolio; CAREC Institute; CAREC Website Unit.

## RESULTS FRAMEWORK DEFINITIONS AND SOURCES

### Level 1—CAREC Region Development Outcomes

Indicator	Definition and Source
<b>Poverty Reduction</b>	
Population living below \$2/day	<p><b>Definition:</b> Percentage of the population living on less than \$2-a-day measured at 2005 international prices adjusted for purchasing power parity (PPP). The \$2-a-day poverty line is compared to consumption or income per person and includes consumption from own production and income in kind.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> World Bank PovcalNet Online. April 2011.</p>
Human Development Index	<p><b>Definition:</b> The Human Development Index (HDI) is a composite index measuring average achievement in three basic dimensions of human development—a long and healthy life (life expectancy at birth); access to knowledge (mean years of schooling, and expected years of schooling); and a decent standard of living (GDI per capita [PPP US\$]). The HDI provides a single statistic as a frame of reference for both social and economic development. The HDI sets a minimum and a maximum for each dimension, called goalposts, and then shows where each country stands in relation to these goalposts, expressed as a value between 0 and 1.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> United Nations Development Programme. <i>Human Development Reports</i>. New York.</p>
Gender Inequality Index	<p><b>Definition:</b> The Gender Inequality Index (GII) reflects women's disadvantage in three dimensions—reproductive health, empowerment and the labor market. The index shows the loss in human development due to inequality between female and male achievements in these dimensions. It ranges from 0, which indicates that women and men fare equally, to 1, which indicates that women fare worse in all measured dimensions.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> United Nations Development Programme. <i>Human Development Report 2010</i>. New York.</p>
<b>Gross Domestic Product, Trade, and Business Environment</b>	
GDP per capita PPP (\$)	<p><b>Definition:</b> Sum of gross value added by all resident producers in the economy plus any product taxes and minus any subsidies not included in the value of the products, divided by population. It is calculated without deductions for depreciation of fabricated assets or for depletion and degradation of natural resources and at market prices based on constant local currency.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> World Bank. World Development Indicators Online. April 2011.</p>
GDP PPP (constant 2005 international \$ billion)	<p><b>Definition:</b> Gross domestic product (GDP) is the sum of value added by all resident producers plus any product taxes (less subsidies) not included in the valuation of output. Growth is calculated from constant price GDP data in local currency.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> World Bank. World Development Indicators Online. April 2011.</p>

Indicator	Definition and Source
Real GDP growth rate (%)	<p><b>Definition:</b> Average annual growth of sum of value added by all resident producers in the economy plus any product taxes (less subsidies) not included in the valuation of output, calculated without making deductions for depreciation of fabricated capital assets for depletion and degradation of natural resources, expressed in purchasing power parity (PPP) US dollar terms.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> World Bank. World Development Indicators Online. April 2011.</p>
Labor force participation rate (%)	<p><b>Definition.</b> Percentage of the working-age population (ages 15-64) that actively engages in the labor market by either working or actively looking for work.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> World Development Indicators Online. April 2011.</p>
Women employed in nonagricultural sector (%)	<p><b>Definition:</b> Share of female workers in nonagricultural sector expressed as a percentage of total employment in the sector. Nonagricultural sector includes industry and services. Following the International Standard Industrial Classification of All Economic Activities, "industry" includes mining and quarrying (including oil production), manufacturing, construction, electricity, gas and water. "Services" includes wholesale and retail trade; restaurants and hotels; transport, storage and communications; financing, insurance, real estate and business services; and community, social and personal services.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> World Bank. World Development Indicators Online. April 2011.</p>
Real growth in trade of goods and services (%)	<p><b>Definition:</b> Average annual growth rate of total exports and imports in goods and services, deflated by import and export prices maintained by Development Prospects Group 2000. This indicator reflects the trade expansion of a country over the period.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> World Bank. World Trade Indicators Online. April 2011.</p>
Intraregional energy trade (GWh)	<p><b>Definition:</b> Total volume of regional electric trade in gigawatt-hours of CAREC members Afghanistan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Republic, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> Central Dispatch Center, Tashkent, Uzbekistan, May 2011.</p>
GDP per unit of energy use (2005 PPP \$ per kilogram of oil equivalent)	<p><b>Definition:</b> The ratio of GDP to energy use indicates energy efficiency. GDP per unit of energy use is the ratio of gross domestic product per kilogram of oil equivalent of energy use, with GDP converted to 2005 constant international dollars using PPP rates. An international dollar has the same purchasing power over GDP that a dollar has in the United States. Energy use refers to the use of primary energy before transmission to other end-use fuel, which is indigenous production plus imports and stock changes minus exports and fuel supplied to ships and aircraft engaged in international transport.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> World Bank. World Development Indicators Online. April 2011.</p>

Indicator	Definition and Source
Foreign direct investment, net inflows (% GDP)	<p><b>Definition:</b> International investment that obtains a lasting interest (at least 10%) in an enterprise resident in another economy. The components of foreign direct investment (FDI) are equity capital, reinvested earnings and other capital (mainly intra-company loans). As countries do not always collect data for each of those components, reported data on FDI are not fully comparable across countries. In particular, data on reinvested earnings, the collection of which depends on company surveys, are often unreported by many countries.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> World Bank. World Development Indicators Online. April 2011.</p>

CAREC = Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation, FDI = foreign direct investment, GDI = gender-related development index, GDP = gross domestic product, HDI = human development index, PPP = purchasing power parity.

### Level 2—CAREC Priority Sector Outputs

Indicator	Definition <sup>a</sup> and Source
<b>Transport and Trade Facilitation Sectors</b>	
Expressways or national highways built or improved (km)	<p><b>Definition:</b> Length of expressways (i.e. fully access controlled highways) built or improved, expressed in km. Access control means no direct crossings. 'Expressways' can include roads that in certain countries are called highways if they have full access control. 'Improving' includes all activity to restore a degraded road to originally intended design capacity (repair/rehabilitation) and to improve on its design capacity (e.g. by widening). 'Improving' cannot be applied in cases where only road signage is improved.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> Transport and Trade Facilitation Coordinating Committee, Country Progress Reports for transport indicators.</p>
Proportion of total CAREC road corridor built or improved (%)	<p><b>Definition:</b> Percentage total of all CAREC road corridors built or improved through CAREC investment activities that meet appropriate international roughness index standards. Road should be open to public use.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> Transport and Trade Facilitation Coordinating Committee, Country Progress Reports for transport indicators.</p>
Time taken to clear a border crossing (minutes)	<p><b>Definition:</b> The average duration (in minutes) taken to move cargo from an exit point of a country to the entry point of another country. The entry and exit points are typically a primary control center where customs, immigration and quarantine (CIQ) are done. Besides the standard formalities to clear CIQ, this measurement also includes waiting time, unloading and loading time, change of rail gauges and so forth, to capture both complexity and inefficiencies inherent in the border crossing process. This indicator is normalized at 500 km as a basis of unit, so that duration between long and short corridors is comparable.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> CAREC Corridor Performance Measurement and Monitoring Reports.</p>
Costs incurred at a border crossing clearance (\$)	<p><b>Definition:</b> The average of total expenses (\$) to move cargo from an exit point of a country to the entry point of another country. The entry and exit points are typically a primary control center where CIQ are done. Both official and unofficial payments are included. This indicator is normalized at 500 km as a basis of unit, so that average cost between long and short corridors is comparable.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> CAREC Corridor Performance Measurement and Monitoring Reports.</p>
Speed to travel 500 km on CAREC Corridor section (km/hour)	<p><b>Definition:</b> The average speed for a unit of cargo to travel within the country and across borders. A unit of cargo refers to a cargo truck with 20 tons of goods (for road transport) or a rail wagon with one 20-foot equivalent unit (for rail transport). Speed is calculated by taking the total distance traveled divided by the total time taken; both distance and time include border crossings.</p> <p><b>Source:</b> CAREC Corridor Performance Measurement and Monitoring Reports.</p>



Indicator	Definition <sup>s</sup> and Source
Costs incurred to travel corridor section(\$)	<p>Definition: The average of total costs “with delays” incurred for a unit of cargo to travel within the country and across borders. A unit of cargo refers to a cargo truck with 20 tons of goods (for road transport) or a rail wagon with one 20-foot equivalent unit (for rail transport). Both official and unofficial payments are included.</p> <p>Source: CAREC Corridor Performance Measurement and Monitoring Reports.</p>
<b>Trade Policy Sector</b>	
CAREC Trade Liberalization Index	<p>Definition: Composite indicator measuring achievement in prioritized actions leading toward effective trade liberalization, as a first step in the process of WTO accession. Progress is monitored in the following areas: (i) tariffication of quantitative restrictions, (ii) tariff simplification, and (iii) reduction of impediments to transit trade.</p> <p>Source: Data are extracted from an annual IMF-conducted questionnaire survey of eight CAREC partners.</p>
<b>Energy Sector</b>	
Transmission lines installed or upgraded (km)	<p>Definition: Transmission lines <math>\geq 110\text{kV}</math> (some countries may report only <math>\geq 220\text{kV}</math>, which was accepted by the committee because it will under-report performance), constructed or upgraded (km).</p> <p>Source: CAREC-related project completion and validation reports, and CAREC multilateral institution online project databases.</p>
Increased energy generation capacity (MW)	<p>Definition: Increased energy generation capacity (expressed in megawatts) is incremental capacity created by the project, and the aggregate of the following categories: (i) MW capacity of new power plant projects; (ii) incremental MW as the result of rehabilitation project; and (iii) MW-equivalent capacity of heating supply added.</p> <p>Source: CAREC-related project completion and validation reports, and CAREC multilateral institution online project databases.</p>

CAREC = Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation, CIQ = customs, immigration and quarantine, ESCC = Energy Sector Coordinating Committee, IMF = International Monetary Fund, km = kilometer, MW = megawatt, WTO = World Trade Organization.

<sup>a</sup> The sector coordinating committees are responsible for identifying appropriate sources for data collection for Level 2 indicators.

### Level 3—Operational and Organizational Effectiveness

Indicator	Definition <sup>a</sup>
<b>Operations Growth</b>	
Number of investment projects approved (loans and grants, cumulative since 2001)	CAREC-related project completion and validation reports, and CAREC multilateral institution online project databases. Number of CAREC-related multilateral institution/country government projects (loans and grants) approved.
Volume of approved investment projects (loans and grants; cumulative since 2001, \$ million)	Total volume of CAREC-related multilateral institution/country government projects (loans and grants) approved.
Number of completed investment projects (cumulative since 2001)	Number of multilateral institution-validated project completion reports, rating projects “successful or better”.
<b>Finance Mobilization</b>	
Annual average volume of new approved investment projects (loans and grants, 3-year rolling average, \$ million)	Total volume of CAREC-related projects (loans and grants) from all CAREC partner multilateral institutions and country governments, approved during 12-month period under review.
CAREC technical assistance financing gap (\$, '000)	Outstanding funding gap for proposed/approved priority sector technical assistance projects, forecast for current 12-month period.
<b>Knowledge Management</b>	
Ratings of CAREC-related technical assistance projects completed (% successful)	Number of completion reports prepared for CAREC TAs in the last 3 years with “successful or better” ratings as a percentage of total TA completion reports circulated in those years.
<i>Knowledge sharing and dissemination: work-in-progress</i>	<i>Pending</i>
Participants in CAREC-supported training programs (# person days)	Total count of individuals successfully completing CAREC-sponsored training programs during 12-month period under review.

CAREC = Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation, DEF = development effectiveness review, TA = technical assistance.

<sup>a</sup>The CAREC Secretariat will initially collect data for Level 3 indicators through its CAREC-related project portfolio database. Country government and multilateral institution partners will be requested to assist the CAREC Secretariat by supplying information to keep the portfolio database up-to-date.